



# China Tax Alert

Issue 29, November 2017

## World Customs Organization (“WCO”) Issued a New Case Study on the Use of Transfer Pricing Documentation in Customs Valuation - First Case Contributed by the PRC Customs

### Regulations discussed in this issue:

- WCO issued its second Case Study 14.2 on the connection between transfer pricing and customs valuation

### Background

WCO issued the *Use of Transfer Pricing Documentation When Examining Related Party Transactions under Article 1.2 (a) of the Agreement* (hereinafter referred to as *Case Study 14.2*) end of October 2017. Following the issue of *Case Study 14.1* in April 2016, this is the second case study on transfer pricing and customs valuation issued by WCO, which draws extensive attention from the public. It is worth noting that this is the first time WCO has adopted a case from the PRC Customs and this particular “China Solution” has thus become part of the global customs valuation guidelines. It is a milestone which shows the PRC Customs’ active participation in formulating global customs valuation guidelines.

*Case Study 14.2* is significant to global customs valuation because it proposes to use transfer pricing documentation as the basis of customs valuation by comparing the gross margins of comparable companies to determine if the value of transactions with related parties is at arm’s length. In addition to the point raised in *Case Study 14.1* of using Advance Pricing Agreement (APA) transfer pricing analysis report as the basis to examine whether the transactions with related parties are at arm’s length through study and analysis on Transactional Net Margin Method (TNMM) and operation expenses, *Case Study 14.2* further enhances the reference value of transfer pricing documentation in customs valuation.

### Case facts

In *Case Study 14.2*, ICO, located in country I, is the distributor of XCO of country X. ICO is the sole agency of the luxury bags sold by XCO in

country I. XCO does not sell identical or similar luxury bags to unrelated buyers in country I. Thus, all luxury bags imported into country I by ICO are purchased from XCO. According to ICO's transfer pricing policy, the import price of all luxury bags was determined using Resale Price Method. ICO calculated the import price of luxury bags based on the resale price in country I and the targeted gross margin for the next year recommended by XCO, with the deduction of customs duties. The transfer pricing report indicated that the inter-quartile range of gross margins earned by the 8 selected comparable companies in 2012 was between 35% and 46%, with a median of 43 %. Therefore, gross margin at 64% earned by ICO did not fall within the inter-quartile range. When Customs of country I conducted valuation audit, they regarded that the import prices of ICO have been affected by special relationships and do not meet arm's length requirements.

Main facts of *Case Study 14.2* leading to the above conclusion:

- Since ICO, the exclusive distributor in country I, had failed to provide the test values, the Customs of country I examined the circumstances surrounding the sale on the basis of transfer pricing documentation;
- When examining the import price pricing method, the Customs in country I compared the gross margin of ICO with those of comparable companies to determine if the pricing method had been settled in a way that is consistent with the normal pricing practices in the industry;
- The research of benchmarking study is acceptable to the Customs. Based on functional analysis, there was no significant difference between ICO and all eight comparable companies. In addition, the products of the comparable companies are similar to those sold by ICO.
- The gross margin earned by ICO did not fall within the inter-quartile range and ICO did not make any transfer pricing adjustments in this regard.

### **KPMG observations**

In recent years, transfer pricing of multinational companies has become a new challenge for customs authorities in many countries. It also becomes a hot topic when WCO conducts technical research on valuation matters. WCO issued the *WCO Guide to Customs Valuation and Transfer Pricing* in June 2015, followed by *Case Study 14.1* in April 2016 and *Case Study 14.2* in October 2017. The issuance of the documents reflects the attention of WCO Technical Committee on transfer pricing and indicates that related party transactions have drawn the attention of all countries (especially emerging countries such as China).

This Case study, conducted and drafted by the PRC Technical Committee on Customs Valuation (international team), aims to explain how the Customs applies transfer pricing documentation and other relevant information to ascertain whether the prices paid or payable of imported goods have been influenced by any special relationship between the buyers and the sellers (based on *Article 1.2(a) of the Agreement*).

With the Customs paying increasing attention to transfer pricing arrangements, we suggested that enterprises should consider doing the following: -

- The transfer pricing policy of most trading companies in China is modelled on Resale Price Method ("RPM") or Transaction Net Margin Method ("TNMM") and their testing indicator on operating margins or similar financial indexes. However, due to the significant attention of the Customs paid to gross margins, it is suggested that an analysis be conducted on gross margins when preparing transfer pricing documentation;
- Special factor analysis (e.g. industry analysis, financial analysis and adjustments) should be conducted if the profit is lower than the inter-quartile range in transfer pricing documentation. Considering the difference in a customs valuation review, it is recommended that special circumstances be analysed if the profit is higher than the inter-quartile range;
- When submitting the transfer pricing documentation to the Customs, companies should provide proper explanations regarding the applicability of the documentation to avoid any misunderstanding of the information disclosed and methods applied in the documentation by the Customs;
- It is recommended that a Customs valuation report be compiled with reference to the transfer pricing documentation prepared for tax purposes. Such a report should use customs valuation language and logically present a comprehensive study by consolidating the information and materials that are required to be submitted to the Customs.

#### **KPMG assistance**

- Assist enterprises in addressing inquiries raised by China Customs in respect of customs valuation, including the collection and review of information to be submitted and the preparation of explanation letters, as well as accompany enterprises to submit documents for explanations;
- Assist enterprises in conducting self-reviews to identify mistakes in a timely manner by analysing historical import data, and help enterprises prepare self-inspection reports and make voluntary disclosures to China Customs. KPMG can also provide recommendations for process improvement to mitigate future compliance risks;
- Assist enterprises in the implementation of trade management solutions to incorporate customs declarations/post-clearance reviews into automated processes, thereby reducing manual errors when handling customs declarations.

For any enquiries, please send to our public mailbox: [taxenquiry@kpmg.com](mailto:taxenquiry@kpmg.com) or contact our partners/directors in each China/HK offices.

## Khoonming Ho

Head of Tax,  
KPMG Asia Pacific  
Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7082  
[khoonming.ho@kpmg.com](mailto:khoonming.ho@kpmg.com)

## Lewis Lu

Head of Tax,  
KPMG China  
Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3421  
[lewis.lu@kpmg.com](mailto:lewis.lu@kpmg.com)

## Beijing/Shenyang/Qingdao Vincent Pang

Tel. +86 (532) 8907 1728  
[vincent.pang@kpmg.com](mailto:vincent.pang@kpmg.com)

## Tianjin

**Eric Zhou**  
Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7610  
[ec.zhou@kpmg.com](mailto:ec.zhou@kpmg.com)

## Shanghai/Nanjing/Chengdu

**Anthony Chau**  
Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3206  
[anthony.chau@kpmg.com](mailto:anthony.chau@kpmg.com)

## Hangzhou

**John Wang**  
Tel. +86 (571) 2803 8088  
[john.wang@kpmg.com](mailto:john.wang@kpmg.com)

## Guangzhou

**Lilly Li**  
Tel. +86 (20) 3813 8999  
[lilly.li@kpmg.com](mailto:lilly.li@kpmg.com)

## Fuzhou/Xiamen

**Maria Mei**  
Tel. +86 (592) 2150 807  
[maria.mei@kpmg.com](mailto:maria.mei@kpmg.com)

## Shenzhen

**Eileen Sun**  
Tel. +86 (755) 2547 1188  
[eileen.gh.sun@kpmg.com](mailto:eileen.gh.sun@kpmg.com)

## Hong Kong

**Karmen Yeung**  
Tel. +852 2143 8753  
[karmen.yeung@kpmg.com](mailto:karmen.yeung@kpmg.com)

## Northern China

### Vincent Pang

Head of Tax,  
Northern Region  
Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7516  
+86 (532) 8907 1728  
[vincent.pang@kpmg.com](mailto:vincent.pang@kpmg.com)

### Cheng Chi

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7606  
[cheng.chi@kpmg.com](mailto:cheng.chi@kpmg.com)

### Conrad TURLEY

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7513  
[conrad.turley@kpmg.com](mailto:conrad.turley@kpmg.com)

### Milano Fang

Tel. +86 (532) 8907 1724  
[milano.fang@kpmg.com](mailto:milano.fang@kpmg.com)

### Tony Feng

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7531  
[tony.feng@kpmg.com](mailto:tony.feng@kpmg.com)

### Flora Fan

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7611  
[flora.fan@kpmg.com](mailto:flora.fan@kpmg.com)

### John Gu

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7095  
[john.gu@kpmg.com](mailto:john.gu@kpmg.com)

### Rachel Guan

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7613  
[rachel.guan@kpmg.com](mailto:rachel.guan@kpmg.com)

### Helen Han

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7627  
[h.han@kpmg.com](mailto:h.han@kpmg.com)

### Michael Wong

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7085  
[michael.wong@kpmg.com](mailto:michael.wong@kpmg.com)

### Josephine Jiang

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7511  
[josephine.jiang@kpmg.com](mailto:josephine.jiang@kpmg.com)

### Henry Kim

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 5000  
[henry.kim@kpmg.com](mailto:henry.kim@kpmg.com)

### David Ling

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7083  
[david.ling@kpmg.com](mailto:david.ling@kpmg.com)

### Li Li

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7537  
[li.li@kpmg.com](mailto:li.li@kpmg.com)

### Lisa Li

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7638  
[lisa.h.li@kpmg.com](mailto:lisa.h.li@kpmg.com)

### Thomas Li

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7574  
[thomas.li@kpmg.com](mailto:thomas.li@kpmg.com)

### Larry Li

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7658  
[larry.y.li@kpmg.com](mailto:larry.y.li@kpmg.com)

### Lucia Liu

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7570  
[lucia.j.liu@kpmg.com](mailto:lucia.j.liu@kpmg.com)

### Alan O'Connor

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7521  
[alan.oconnor@kpmg.com](mailto:alan.oconnor@kpmg.com)

### Shirley Shen

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7586  
[yinghua.shen@kpmg.com](mailto:yinghua.shen@kpmg.com)

### Joseph Tam

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7605  
[laiyi.tam@kpmg.com](mailto:laiyi.tam@kpmg.com)

### Joyce Tan

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7666  
[joyce.tan@kpmg.com](mailto:joyce.tan@kpmg.com)

### Cynthia Xie

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7543  
[cynthia.py.xie@kpmg.com](mailto:cynthia.py.xie@kpmg.com)

### Christopher Xing

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7072  
[christopher.xing@kpmg.com](mailto:christopher.xing@kpmg.com)

## Irene Yan

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7508  
[irene.yan@kpmg.com](mailto:irene.yan@kpmg.com)

## Adams Yuan

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7596  
[adams.yuan@kpmg.com](mailto:adams.yuan@kpmg.com)

## Jessie Zhang

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7625  
[jessie.j.zhang@kpmg.com](mailto:jessie.j.zhang@kpmg.com)

## Sheila Zhang

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7507  
[sheila.zhang@kpmg.com](mailto:sheila.zhang@kpmg.com)

## Tiansheng Zhang

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7526  
[tiansheng.zhang@kpmg.com](mailto:tiansheng.zhang@kpmg.com)

## Tracy Zhang

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7509  
[tracy.h.zhang@kpmg.com](mailto:tracy.h.zhang@kpmg.com)

## Eric Zhou

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 7610  
[ec.zhou@kpmg.com](mailto:ec.zhou@kpmg.com)

## Vivian Zhou

Tel. +86 (10) 8508 3360  
[v.zhou@kpmg.com](mailto:v.zhou@kpmg.com)

## Central China

### Anthony Chau

Head of Tax,  
Eastern & Western Region  
Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3206  
[anthony.chau@kpmg.com](mailto:anthony.chau@kpmg.com)

### Yasuhiko Otani

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3360  
[yasuhiko.otani@kpmg.com](mailto:yasuhiko.otani@kpmg.com)

### Johnny Deng

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3457  
[johnny.deng@kpmg.com](mailto:johnny.deng@kpmg.com)

### Cheng Dong

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3410  
[cheng.dong@kpmg.com](mailto:cheng.dong@kpmg.com)

### Marianne Dong

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3436  
[marianne.dong@kpmg.com](mailto:marianne.dong@kpmg.com)

### Chris Ge

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3083  
[chris.ge@kpmg.com](mailto:chris.ge@kpmg.com)

### Chris Ho

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3406  
[chris.ho@kpmg.com](mailto:chris.ho@kpmg.com)

### Henry Wong

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3380  
[henry.wong@kpmg.com](mailto:henry.wong@kpmg.com)

### Jason Jiang

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3527  
[jason.jt.jiang@kpmg.com](mailto:jason.jt.jiang@kpmg.com)

### Flame Jin

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3420  
[flame.jin@kpmg.com](mailto:flame.jin@kpmg.com)

### Sunny Leung

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3488  
[sunny.leung@kpmg.com](mailto:sunny.leung@kpmg.com)

### Michael Li

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3463  
[michael.y.li@kpmg.com](mailto:michael.y.li@kpmg.com)

### Karen Lin

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 4169  
[karen.w.lin@kpmg.com](mailto:karen.w.lin@kpmg.com)

### Benjamin Lu

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3462  
[benjamin.lu@kpmg.com](mailto:benjamin.lu@kpmg.com)

### Christopher Mak

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3409  
[christopher.mak@kpmg.com](mailto:christopher.mak@kpmg.com)

### Henry Ngai

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3411  
[henry.ngai@kpmg.com](mailto:henry.ngai@kpmg.com)

### Naoko Hirasawa

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3098  
[naoko.hirasawa@kpmg.com](mailto:naoko.hirasawa@kpmg.com)

### Ruqiang Pan

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3118  
[ruqiang.pan@kpmg.com](mailto:ruqiang.pan@kpmg.com)

## Amy Rao

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3208  
[amy.rao@kpmg.com](mailto:amy.rao@kpmg.com)

## Wayne Tan

Tel. +86 (28) 8673 3915  
[wayne.tan@kpmg.com](mailto:wayne.tan@kpmg.com)

## Tanya Tang

Tel. +86 (25) 8691 2850  
[tanya.tang@kpmg.com](mailto:tanya.tang@kpmg.com)

## Rachel Tao

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3473  
[rachel.tao@kpmg.com](mailto:rachel.tao@kpmg.com)

## Janet Wang

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3302  
[janet.z.wang@kpmg.com](mailto:janet.z.wang@kpmg.com)

## John Wang

Tel. +86 (571) 2803 8088  
[john.wang@kpmg.com](mailto:john.wang@kpmg.com)

## Mimi Wang

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3250  
[mimi.wang@kpmg.com](mailto:mimi.wang@kpmg.com)

## Jennifer Weng

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3431  
[jennifer.weng@kpmg.com](mailto:jennifer.weng@kpmg.com)

## Grace Xie

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3422  
[grace.xie@kpmg.com](mailto:grace.xie@kpmg.com)

## Bruce Xu

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3396  
[bruce.xu@kpmg.com](mailto:bruce.xu@kpmg.com)

## Jie Xu

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3678  
[jie.xu@kpmg.com](mailto:jie.xu@kpmg.com)

## Robert Xu

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3124  
[robert.xu@kpmg.com](mailto:robert.xu@kpmg.com)

## Yang Yang

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3372  
[yang.yang@kpmg.com](mailto:yang.yang@kpmg.com)

## Jason Yu

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3316  
[jjm.yu@kpmg.com](mailto:jjm.yu@kpmg.com)

## William Zhang

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3415  
[william.zhang@kpmg.com](mailto:william.zhang@kpmg.com)

## Hanson Zhou

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3318  
[hanson.zhou@kpmg.com](mailto:hanson.zhou@kpmg.com)

## Michelle Zhou

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3458  
[michelle.b.zhou@kpmg.com](mailto:michelle.b.zhou@kpmg.com)

## Eric Zhang

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3398  
[eric.z.zhang@kpmg.com](mailto:eric.z.zhang@kpmg.com)

## Kevin Zhu

Tel. +86 (21) 2212 3346  
[kevin.x.zhu@kpmg.com](mailto:kevin.x.zhu@kpmg.com)

## Southern China

### Lilly Li

Head of Tax,  
Southern Region  
Tel. +86 (20) 3813 8999  
[lilly.li@kpmg.com](mailto:lilly.li@kpmg.com)

### Penny Chen

Tel. +1 (408) 367 6086  
[penny.chen@kpmg.com](mailto:penny.chen@kpmg.com)

### Vivian Chen

Tel. +86 (755) 2547 1198  
[vivian.w.chen@kpmg.com](mailto:vivian.w.chen@kpmg.com)

### Nicole Cao

Tel. +86 (20) 3813 8619  
[nicole.cao@kpmg.com](mailto:nicole.cao@kpmg.com)

### Sam Fan

Tel. +86 (755) 2547 1071  
[sam.kh.fan@kpmg.com](mailto:sam.kh.fan@kpmg.com)

### Joe Fu

Tel. +86 (755) 2547 1138  
[joe.fu@kpmg.com](mailto:joe.fu@kpmg.com)

### Ricky Gu

Tel. +86 (20) 3813 8620  
[ricky.gu@kpmg.com](mailto:ricky.gu@kpmg.com)

## Fiona He

Tel. +86 (20) 3813 8623  
[fiona.he@kpmg.com](mailto:fiona.he@kpmg.com)

## Angie Ho

Tel. +86 (755) 2547 1276  
[angie.ho@kpmg.com](mailto:angie.ho@kpmg.com)

## Aileen Jiang

Tel. +86 (755) 2547 1163  
[aileen.jiang@kpmg.com](mailto:aileen.jiang@kpmg.com)

## Cloris Li

Tel. +86 (20) 3813 8829  
[cloris.li@kpmg.com](mailto:cloris.li@kpmg.com)

## Jean Li

Tel. +86 (755) 2547 1128  
[jean.j.li@kpmg.com](mailto:jean.j.li@kpmg.com)

## Sisi Li

Tel. +86 (20) 3813 8887  
[sisi.li@kpmg.com](mailto:sisi.li@kpmg.com)

## Mabel Li

Tel. +86 (755) 2547 1164  
[mabel.li@kpmg.com](mailto:mabel.li@kpmg.com)

## Kelly Liao

Tel. +86 (20) 3813 8668